## The School Board of Broward County, Florida Procurement & Warehousing Services

| ITB / RFP No.: | 18-010V                          | Tentative Board Meet | ing Date*: | AUGUST 22, 2017 |    |  |  |  |
|----------------|----------------------------------|----------------------|------------|-----------------|----|--|--|--|
| Description:   | VOLUNTARY SUPPLEMENTAL INSURANCE | Notified:            | 600        | Downloaded:     | 54 |  |  |  |
|                | FOR SCHOOL BOARD EMPLOYEES       | ITB / RFP Rec'd:     | 8          | No. Bids:       | 0  |  |  |  |
| For:           | BENEFITS & EMPLOYMENT SERVICES   | ITB / RFP Opening:   | FEBRUA     | RY 9, 2017      |    |  |  |  |
| Fund:          | N/A                              | Advertised Date:     | DECEME     | BER 15, 2016    |    |  |  |  |

POSTING OF ITB / RFP RECOMMENDATION/TABULATION: ITB / RFP Recommendations and Tabulations will be posted in the Procurement & Warehousing Services and <a href="www.Demandstar.com">www.Demandstar.com</a> on <a href="APRIL 3, 2017">APRIL 3, 2017</a> @ 3:00 pm</a> and will remain posted for 72 hours. Any person who is adversely affected by the decision or intended decision shall file a notice of protest, in writing, within 72 hours after the posting of the notice of decision or intended decision. The formal written protest shall be filed within ten (10) days after the date the notice of protest is filed. Failure to file a notice of protest or failure to file a formal written protest shall constitute a waiver of proceedings under this chapter. Section 120.57(3)(b), Florida Statutes, states that "The formal written protest shall state with particularity the facts and law upon which the protest is based." Saturdays, Sundays, state holidays and days during which the District is closed shall be excluded in the computation of the 72-hour time period provided. Filings shall be at the office of the Director of Procurement & Warehousing Services, 7720 West Oakland Park Boulevard, Suite 323, Sunrise, Florida 33351. Any person who files an action protesting an intended decision shall post with the School Board, at the time of filing the formal written protest, a bond, payable to The School Board of Broward County, Florida, (SBBC), in an amount equal to one percent (1%) of the estimated value of the contract. Failure to post the bond required by SBBC Policy 3320, Part VIII, Purchasing Policies, Section N, within the time allowed for filing a bond shall constitute a waiver of the right to protest.

(\*) The Cone of Silence, as stated in the ITB / RFP, is in effect until this ITB / RFP is approved by SBBC. The Board meeting date stated above is tentative. Confirm with the Purchasing Agent of record for the actual date the Cone of Silence has concluded.

#### RECOMMENDATION TABULATION

BASED UPON THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE SUPERINTENDENT'S INSURANCE & WELLNESS ADVISORY COMMITTEE (SIWAC), IT IS RECOMMENDED THAT THE FOLLOWING LISTED PROPOSERS BE RECOMMENDED FOR AWARD FOR INDIVIDUAL INSURANCE PLANS FOR VOLUNTARY SUPPLEMENTAL INSURANCE FOR SCHOOL BOARD EMPLOYEES.

| COVERAGE                  | PROPOSER  |
|---------------------------|---|
| ACCIDENT PLANS            | CONTINENTAL AMERICAN INSURANCE COMPANY D/B/A AFLAC CNO SERVICES, LLC D/B/A WASHINGTON NATIONAL INSURANCE COMPANY PENNSYLVANIA CASUALTY COMPANY D/B/A COMBINED INSURANCE COMPANY OF AMERICA – COMBINED WORKSITE SOLUTIONS                              |
| *CANCER PLANS             | CNO SERVICES, LLC D/B/A WASHINGTON NATIONAL INSURANCE COMPANY   |
| *CONSUMER FINANCIAL PLANS | BMG MONEY, INC.   |
| CRITICAL ILLNESS PLANS    | CONTINENTAL AMERICAN INSURANCE COMPANY D/B/A AFLAC CNO SERVICES, LLC D/B/A WASHINGTON NATIONAL INSURANCE COMPANY PENNSYLVANIA CASUALTY COMPANY D/B/A COMBINED INSURANCE COMPANY OF AMERICA – COMBINED WORKSITE SOLUTIONS                              |
| *HOSPITAL INDEMNITY PLANS | CONTINENTAL AMERICAN INSURANCE COMPANY D/B/A AFLAC  |
| LIFE INSURANCE PLANS      | CONTINENTAL AMERICAN INSURANCE COMPANY D/B/A AFLAC TEXAS LIFE INSURANCE COMPANY CNO SERVICES, LLC D/B/A WASHINGTON NATIONAL INSURANCE COMPANY PENNSYLVANIA CASUALTY COMPANY D/B/A COMBINED INSURANCE COMPANY OF AMERICA – COMBINED WORKSITE SOLUTIONS |

The School Board of Broward County, Florida, prohibits any policy or procedure which results in discrimination on the basis of age, color, disability, gender expression, national origin, marital status, race, religion, sex or sexual orientation. Individuals who wish to file a discrimination complaint, may call the Executive Director, Benefits & EEO Compliance at 754-321-2150 or Teletype Machine (TTY) at 754-321-2158.

RECOMMENDATION TABULATION 18-010V - VOLUNTARY SUPPLEMENTAL INSURANCE FOR SCHOOL BOARD EMPLOYEES PAGE 2

\*PREPAID LEGAL PLANS

U.S.LEGAL SERVICES, INC.

\*SHORT TERM LIABILITY PLANS

CONTINENTAL AMERICAN INSURANCE COMPANY D/B/A AFLAC

M/WBE ADVISOR: LAVINIA FREEMAN, M/WBE SPECIALIST III

(\*) IN ACCORDANCE WITH SECTION 5.1 OF THE RFP, EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS, IF ONLY ONE PROPOSAL IS RECEIVED, THE COMMITTEE MAY PROCEED WITHOUT SCORING THE ONE RESPONSIVE PROPOSAL AND MAY NEGOTIATE THE BEST TERMS AND CONDITIONS WITH THAT SOLE PROPOSER OR MAY RECOMMEND THE REJECTION OF ALL PROPOSALS AS PERMITTED BY SECTION 6A-1.012(12)(c), F.A.C. THE COMMITTEE ELECTED TO NEGOTIATE WITH THE SOLE PROPOSER FOR EACH INSURANCE PLAN AS INDICATED ABOVE.

A PROPOSAL WAS RECEIVED FROM NATIONWIDE FOR PET INSURANCE. DURING NEGOTIATIONS, THE COMMITTEE DECLARED AN IMPASSE IN WRITING A CONTRACT WITH NATIONWIDE AND THE COMMITTEE DECIDED TO REJECT ALL PROPOSALS RECEIVED FOR PET INSURANCE.

NO PROPOSALS WERE RECEIVED FOR LONG-TERM CARE AND HOMEOWNERS INSURANCE; THESE PLANS WILL NOT BE REBID.

IT IS RECOMMENDED FOR REASON STATED ON THE ATTACHED RFP REJECTION SHEET, THE RFP IN ITS ENTIRETY BE REJECTED FOR NOT COMPLYING WITH THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE RFP.

CONTRACT PERIOD: JANUARY 1, 2018 THROUGH DECEMBER 31, 2020

|     | 11211              |              |  |
|-----|--------------------|--------------|--|
| Ву: | CVary              | Date: 4/3/17 |  |
|     | (Purchasing Agent) |              |  |

The School Board of Broward County, Florida, prohibits any policy or procedure which results in discrimination on the basis of age, color, disability, gender expression, national origin, marital status, race, religion, sex or sexual orientation. Individuals who wish to file a discrimination complaint, may call the Executive Director, Benefits & EEO Compliance at 754-321-2150 or Teletype Machine (TTY) at 754-321-2158.

| Voluntary Supplemental Insurance for<br>School Board Employees<br>RFP 18-010V<br>Accident | Max Points | Shawn Mass | Erum Motiwala | Craig Nichols | Harold "Chip" Osborr | Daniel Reynolds | Donna Sacco | Pete Tingom | Jack Vesey | Joseph Zeppetella | Average Score |
|---|------------|------------|---------------|---------------|----------------------|-----------------|-------------|-------------|------------|-------------------|---------------|
| Section A: Experience and Qualifications  | 30         | 1 4        |               |               |                      |                 |             |             |            |                   |               |
|   | AFLAC      | 30         | 25            | 25            | 27                   | 27              | 23          | 27          | 28         | 28                | 27            |
| Combined Insurance Company o  | f America  | 28         | 20            | 25            | 15                   | 21              | 20          | 28          | 26         | 20                | 23            |
| Washington National Insurance   | Company    | 29         | 22            | 25            | 20                   | 27              | 24          | 25          | 24         | 17                | 24            |
| Section B: Scope of Services  | 30         |            |               |               |                      |                 |             |             |            |                   |               |
| 21  | AFLAC      | 27         | 25            | 25            | 27                   | 28              | 22          | 25          | 28         | 26                | 26            |
| Combined Insurance Company o  | f America  | 25         | 18            | 25            | 15                   | 25              | 19          | 23          | 28         | 22                | 22            |
| Washington National Insurance   | Company    | 22         | 20            | 25            | 25                   | 27              | 21          | 27          | 28         | 20                | 24            |
| Section C: Cost of Services   | 30         |            |               |               |                      |                 |             |             |            |                   |               |
|   | AFLAC      | 25         | 25            | 25            | 20                   | 28              | 23          | 24          | 28         | 21                | 24            |
| Combined Insurance Company of   | f America  | 20         | 20            | 27            | 25                   | 26              | 21          | 28          | 26         | 28                | 25            |
| Washington National Insurance   | Company    | 23         | 18            | 21            | 15                   | 27              | 20          | 20          | 24         | 14                | 20            |
| Section D1: Supplier Diversity & Outreach Program (M/WBE Participation)                   |            |            |               |               |                      |                 |             |             |            |                   |               |
|   | AFLAC      | 6          | 6             | 6             | 6                    | 4               | 6           | 6           | 5          | 6                 | 6             |
| Combined Insurance Company of   | of America | 0          | 0             | 0             | 0                    | 0               | 0           | 0           | 3          | 0                 | 0             |
| Washington National Insurance   | Company    | 4          | 2             | 2             | 2                    | 2               | 4           | 4           | 4          | 2                 | 3             |

| Voluntary Supplemental Insurance for<br>School Board Employees<br>RFP 18-010V<br>Accident | Max Points | Shawn Mass | Erum Motiwala | Craig Nichols | Harold "Chip" Osborr | Daniel Reynolds | Donna Sacco | Pete Tingom | Jack Vesey | Joseph Zeppetella | Average Score |
|---|------------|------------|---------------|---------------|----------------------|-----------------|-------------|-------------|------------|-------------------|---------------|
| Section D2: Supplier Diversity & Outreach Program (Employment Diversity Statistics)       | 2          |            |               |               |                      |                 |             |             |            |                   |               |
|   | AFLAC      | 2          | 0             | 0             | 2                    | 2               | 2           | 2           | 2          | 2                 | 2             |
| Combined Insurance Company o  | f America  | 2          | 0             | 2             | 2                    | 2               | 2           | 0           | 2          | 2                 | 2             |
| Washington National Insurance   | Company    | 2          | 2             | 0             | 2                    | 2               | 2           | 2           | 2          | 2                 | 2             |
| Section D3: Supplier Diversity & Outreach Program (Involvement in Minority Community)     | 2          |            |               |               |                      |                 |             |             |            |                   |               |
|   | AFLAC      | 0          | 2             | 0             | 0                    | 2               | 0           | 0           | 0          | 0                 | 0             |
| Combined Insurance Company of   | f America  | 0          | 2             | 0.            | 0                    | 0               | 0           | 2           | 0          | 0                 | 0             |
| Washington National Insurance   | Company    | 0          | 0             | 0             | 0                    | 0               | 0           | 0           | 0          | 0                 | 0             |
| TOTAL SCORE   | 100        |            |               |               |                      |                 |             |             |            |                   |               |
|   | AFLAC      | 90         | 83            | 81            | 82                   | 91              | 76          | 84          | 91         | 83                | 84.6          |
| Combined Insurance Company of America   |            | 75         | 60            | 79            | 57                   | 74              | 62          | 81          | 85         | 72                | 71.7          |
| Washington National Insurance   | Company    | 80         | 64            | 73            | 64                   | 85              | 71          | 78          | 82         | 55                | 72.4          |

| Signature:  | Date: |
|-------------|-------|
| Jigitatu C. |       |

| Voluntary Supplemental Insurance for<br>School Board Employees<br>RFP 18-010V<br>Critical Illness | Max Points                            | Shawn Mass | Erum Motiwala | Craig Nichols | Harold "Chip" Osborn | Daniel Reynolds | Donna Sacco | Pete Tingom | Jack Vesey | Joseph Zeppetella | Average Score |
|---|---------------------------------------|------------|---------------|---------------|----------------------|-----------------|-------------|-------------|------------|-------------------|---------------|
| Section A: Experience and Qualifications  | 30                                    |            |               |               | 1 2                  |                 |             |             |            |                   |               |
|   | AFLAC                                 | 30         | 27            | 25            | 27                   | 28              | 22          | 27          | 28         | 28                | 27            |
| Combined Insurance Company of   |                                       | 28         | 20            | 25            | 15                   | 23              | 19          | 26          | 24         | 17                | 22            |
| Washington National Insurance   | Company                               | 29         | 19            | 25            | 20                   | 27              | 21          | 28          | 26         | 20                | 24            |
| Section B: Scope of Services  | 30                                    |            |               |               |                      |                 |             |             |            |                   |               |
|   | AFLAC                                 | 27         | 26            | 25            | 25                   | 28              | 22          | 24          | 28         | 25                | 26            |
| Combined Insurance Company of   | Combined Insurance Company of America |            | 20            | 25            | 20                   | 26              | 21          | 27          | 28         | 22                | 24            |
| Washington National Insurance   | Company                               | 28         | 19            | 25            | 15                   | 27              | 23          | 25          | 28         | 20                | 23            |
| Section C: Cost of Services   | 30                                    | 8 1        |               |               |                      |                 |             |             |            |                   |               |
|   | AFLAC                                 | 28         | 27            | 26            | 20                   | 28              | 26          | 28          | 25         | 29                | 26            |
| Combined Insurance Company of   | of America                            | 25         | 21            | 25            | 27                   | 26              | 25          | 22          | 24         | 20                | 24            |
| Washington National Insurance   | Company                               | 22         | 17            | 24            | 15                   | 24              | 24          | 18          | 26         | 12                | 20            |
| Section D1: Supplier Diversity & Outreach Program (M/WBE Participation)                           | 6                                     |            |               |               |                      |                 |             |             |            |                   |               |
|   | AFLAC                                 | 6          | 6             | 6             | 6                    | 4               | 6           | 6           | 6          | 6                 | 6             |
| Combined Insurance Company of   | of America                            | 0          | 0             | 0             | 0                    | 0               | 0           | 0           | 0          | 0                 | 0             |
| Washington National Insurance Company   |                                       | 4          | 2             | 2             | 2                    | 2               | 4           | 4           | 2          | 2                 | 3             |
| Section D2: Supplier Diversity & Outreach Program (Employment Diversity Statistics)               | 2                                     |            |               |               |                      |                 |             |             |            |                   |               |
|   | AFLAC                                 | 2          | 0             | 2             | 2                    | 2               | 2           | 2           | 2          | 2                 | 2             |
| Combined Insurance Company  | of America                            | 2          | 0             | 2             | 2                    | 2               | 2           | 0           | 2          | 2                 | 2             |

| Washington National Insurance C   | ompany  | 2   | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2   | 2    |
|---|---------|-----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|-----|------|
| Section D3: Supplier Diversity & Outreach Program (Involvement in Minority Community) | 2       |     |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |     |      |
|   | AFLAC   | 0   | 2  | 0  | 0  | 2  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0   | 0    |
| Combined Insurance Company of   | America | 0   | 2  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 2  | 0  | 0   | 0    |
| Washington National Insurance C   | ompany  | 0   | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0   | 0    |
| TOTAL SCORE   | 100     | 198 | 35 |    |    |    |    |    |    | No. |      |
|   | AFLAC   | 93  | 88 | 84 | 80 | 92 | 78 | 87 | 89 | 90  | 86.8 |
| Combined Insurance Company of America   |         | 79  | 63 | 77 | 64 | 77 | 67 | 77 | 78 | 61  | 71.4 |
| Washington National Insurance C   | Company | 85  | 59 | 78 | 54 | 82 | 74 | 77 | 84 | 56  | 72.1 |

| Signature: | Date: |
|------------|-------|
|            | ·     |

| Voluntary Supplemental Insurance for<br>School Board Employees<br>RFP 18-010V<br>Life Insurance | Max Points | Shawn Mass | Erum Motiwala | Craig Nichols | Harold "Chip" Osborn | Daniel Reynolds | Donna Sacco | Pete Tingom | Jack Vesey | Joseph Zeppetella | Average Score |
|---|------------|------------|---------------|---------------|----------------------|-----------------|-------------|-------------|------------|-------------------|---------------|
| Section A: Experience and Qualifications  | 30         |            |               |               |                      |                 |             |             |            |                   |               |
|   | AFLAC      | 30         | 25            | 25            | 25                   | 26              | 25          | 21          | 28         | 28                | 26            |
| Combined Insurance Company of   |            | 28         | 20            | 25            | 15                   | 24              | 24          | 27          | 26         | 17                | 23            |
| Texas Life Insurance  | Company    | 29         | 27            | 25            | 27                   | 27              | 22          | 29          | 24         | 20                | 26            |
| Washington National Insurance   | Company    | 29         | 18            | 25            | 20                   | 28              | 24          | 28          | 24         | 20                | 24            |
| Section B: Scope of Services  | 30         |            |               |               |                      |                 |             |             |            |                   |               |
|   | AFLAC      | 28         | 24            | 25            | 15                   | 27              | 26          | 24          | 26         | 20                | 24            |
| Combined Insurance Company of   | f America  | 24         | 18            | 25            | 22                   | 27              | 24          | 27          | 26         | 21                | 24            |
| Texas Life Insurance  | Company    | 27         | 22            | 25            | 25                   | 27              | 23          | 29          | 26         | 26                | 26            |
| Washington National Insurance   | Company    | 25         | 20            | 25            | 17                   | 27              | 25          | 25          | 26         | 24                | 24            |
| Section C: Cost of Services   | 30         |            |               |               |                      |                 |             |             |            |                   |               |
|   | AFLAC      | 22         | 20            | 23            | 15                   | 26              | 28          | 16          | 28         | 20                | 22            |
| Combined Insurance Company o  | f America  | 25         | 24            | 25            | 25                   | 28              | 27          | 24          | 24         | 25                | 25            |
| Texas Life Insurance  | Company    | 26         | 26            | 26            | 27                   | 28              | 24          | 28          | 22         | 29                | 26            |
| Washington National Insurance   | Company    | 23         | 22            | 24            | 17                   | 26              | 23          | 20          | 26         | 17                | 22            |
| Section D1: Supplier Diversity & Outreach Program (M/WBE Participation)                         | h          |            |               | Ve Vi         |                      |                 |             |             |            |                   |               |
|   | AFLAC      | 6          | 6             | 6             | 6                    | 4               | 6           | 6           | 6          | 6                 | 6             |
| Combined Insurance Company of America   |            | 0          | 0             | 0             | 0                    | 0               | 0           | 0           | 0          | 0                 | 0             |
| Texas Life Insurance Company  |            | 0          | 0             | 0             | 0                    | 0               | 0           | 2           | 0          | 0                 | 0             |
| Washington National Insurance   | Company    | 4          | 2             | 2             | 2                    | 2               | 4           | 2           | 2          | 2                 | 2             |

| Section D2: Supplier Diversity & Outreach Program (Employment Diversity Statistics)   | 2        |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |      |
|---|----------|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|------|
| AFI   | AC       | 2  | 0  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2    |
| Combined Insurance Company of Ame   | rica     | 2  | 0  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 0  | 2  | 2  | 2    |
| Texas Life Insurance Comp   | any      | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2    |
| Washington National Insurance Comp  | any      | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 0  | 2  | 2  | 2    |
| Section D3: Supplier Diversity & Outreach Program (Involvement in Minority Community) | N. N. W. |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |      |
| AFL   | _AC      | 0  | 2  | 0  | 0  | 2  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0    |
| Combined Insurance Company of Ame   | rica     | 0  | 2  | 2  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 2  | 0  | 0  | 1    |
| Texas Life Insurance Comp   | any      | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0    |
| Washington National Insurance Comp  | any      | 0  | 0  | 2  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0    |
| TOTAL SCORE 10  | 0        |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |    |      |
| AFI   | AC       | 88 | 77 | 81 | 63 | 87 | 87 | 69 | 90 | 76 | 79.8 |
| Combined Insurance Company of America  Texas Life Insurance Company                   |          | 79 | 64 | 79 | 64 | 81 | 77 | 80 | 78 | 65 | 74.1 |
|   |          | 84 | 77 | 78 | 81 | 84 | 71 | 90 | 74 | 77 | 79.6 |
| Washington National Insurance Company   |          | 83 | 64 | 80 | 58 | 85 | 78 | 75 | 80 | 65 | 74.2 |

| Signature: | Date: |
|------------|-------|
| 9 pt 16    |       |

#### RFP 18-010V

# VOLUNTARY SUPPLEMENTAL INSURANCE FOR SCHOOL BOARD EMPLOYEES RFP REJECTION SHEET

Reject entire proposal from <u>Legal Access Consulting, LLC d/b/a LegalEASE</u>. Proposer did not meet the Minimum Eligibility Requirements of the RFP for Section 4.2.6; therefore, their proposal was rejected.